

# THE SHIFTING OF REPRESENTATION: FROM A FEMALE REGENT PRESENCE TO THE POLICY INTEREST OF RURAL WOMEN

[1] **Siti Mauliana Hairini\***; [2] **Noviana Sari**  
Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin, Indonesia  
Email: [siti.hairini@ulm.ac.id](mailto:siti.hairini@ulm.ac.id)

\* *Corresponding Author*

**Citation:** Hairini, Siti Mauliana., Noviana Sari., 2023. The Shifting Of Representation: From A Female Regent Presence To The Policy Interest Of Rural Women. *Int' Journal of Law, Environment, and Natural Resources (INJURLENS)*, 3 (2), 292-310.

**Academic Editor:** Muhammad Hendri Yanova  
Received: 01 June 2023  
Revised: 02 July 2023  
Accepted: 17 November 2023  
Published: 23 Februari 2024

Publisher's Note: Scholar Center stays neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.



**Copyright:**

© 2023 by the authors. Submitted for open access publication in International Journal of Law, Environment, and Natural Resources (INJURLENS) under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 license (CC BY NC SA 4.0). For more information visit (<http://creativecommons.org>).

**Abstract:** Exclusively, The theoretical and empirical studies on women's representation have focused on parliament and the existing literature on women in politics. The substantive representation become one of the main concerns of the scholars to be an instrument of how to pursue women's issues while, this paper has tried to analyze how the descriptive representation and the substantive representation are inseparable from female regent existence in politics. In the debate between descriptive representation and substantive representation of women in pursuing conservative political issues for rural women, this study considers that there is a causal relationship between the two representation models. The politics of presence and ideas of female Regent who implemented electronic voting (e-voting) in simultaneous village head elections in Barito Kuala District has strongly created a symbol for women that indirectly fostered a sense of commons destiny and experience for women to encourage their participation and increase the electability of women in village politics.

**Keywords:** Democracy; Representation; Rural; Women.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The presence of women leaders in politics, especially in the local sector, shows the representation of women in contributing to gender equality (Dewi, 2012a). In modern times almost everyone wants to be ruled by proxy; every political group or cause wants representation; every government claims to represent. Pitkin said a king can represent a nation, just like an ambassador (Pitkin, 1967). Women's representation is important

to provide better representation with the presence of women does little to increase the effective representation of women's interests (Kurebwa, 2015).

Modern democracy is often seen as synonymous with representative democracy, while the concept of representation was initiated by the seventeenth-century British political theorist Thomas Hobbes, who was treated first as the thinker who clarified most of the defining features of modern politics (Runciman, 2010). Representative. Hobbes begins by distinguishing between two types of people to suit these two possibilities: natural and artificial which leads to the concept of the concept of "authorization" (or what Pitkin later calls the concept of "substantive"), in which political representation emerges. as a form of "acting for" not just "standing for" (Pitkin, 1967).

In the Concept of Representation, Hanna Pitkin (1967) argues that the person being represented must be judged by his actions which he calls substantive representation, and not just the closeness of his characteristics to his constituents such as descriptive representation. Research on women's substantive representation and its relation to women's descriptive representation has dominated research on gender and politics over the past decade (Asiedu et al., n.d.; Celis et al., 2008; Celis & Childs, 2012; Dovi, 2007; Galligan, 2007; Hillman, 2018; Shim, 2021; Uhlener, 2012; Wängnerud, 2009). This paper sometimes acknowledges that 'Critical Mass theory' is added to the mix: women's substantive representation occurs when women's political presence constitutes (Celis et al., 2008; Krook, 2010). Even the substantive representation of women's literature is debatable because some studies have confirmed the hypothesis that the presence of women advances women's substantive representation, but others have shown that the relationship between women's representation and more feminist substantive representation is highly institutional (gender) dependent. exclusive contexts and issues (Celis & Childs, 2012; J. Lovenduski, 2005; P. N. and J. Lovenduski, 1993).

The exclusive focus on feminist actors and policies creates blind spots and biases in our empirical research and limits the very concept of representation to pushing conservative women like Margaret Thatcher or Sarah Palin back as women's representatives (Celis & Childs, 2012; Weaver, n.d.). Such as the representation of women in Indonesian politics when the number of women occupying seats changes

from time to time, even though the numbers tend to increase, they are still underestimated (Perdana & Hillman, 2020). Indonesian women in political research are considered to lack the role and participation of women in policy-making, especially on issues defined by feminism for women (Aspinall et al., 2021; Hillman, 2017; Kania Ikeu et al., 2020; Perdana & Hillman, 2020).

Post-Suharto decentralization and autonomy policies have changed Indonesia's local politics, especially the village autonomy revolution which has had a major impact on the existence of women in political practice or research (Aspinall et al., 2021; Prihatini, 2018; Purwanti et al., 2019). Currently, there have been many studies aimed at understanding the characteristics of Indonesian women today, especially in local politics. Some experts observe the impact of direct regional head elections on women's political roles (Dewi, 2012b). Although there are concerns over the increasing role of women in direct regional head elections, no scholar has yet explained how women's leadership with conservative policies of democratizing through village head elections can turn descriptive representation into substantive representation for rural women who compete in village politics.

We believed that the democratization of local politics through direct village head elections carried out by the first female district head in Barito Kuala as the only female leader in South Kalimantan has created substantive representation for local women in rural level. Based on Barito Kuala Regent Regulation Number 14 of 2021, village head elections used the e-voting method will be carried out in 17 sub-districts with a total of 163 villages which will be carried out in 4 batches over 3 days (IKP, 2021c, 2021d; Rudy, 2021). voting interval which is estimated to take 12 days to be implemented and completed in May 2021. Then the election found 11 (eleven) women who were elected from the local democratization process, even though the minimum quota of 30% was not reached but there was significant progress for women through political competition at village level where Hj. Normiliani had to fight to encourage women from village to village in Barito Kuala (IKP, 2021b, 2021a). We further argue that this positive trend in local politics shows that women's leadership has expanded the concept of substantive

representation through democratization issues that are unpopular for feminism or women's interests.

## **2. METHODS**

This study used a qualitative method with a case study approach to obtain deeper research data and information. The case study was conducted to capture a moment and provide them with in-depth explanations and observations using qualitative research aspects. The researcher applied the case study in Barito Kuala Regent because the research was to find out about the shifting of political women leadership from descriptive representation to substantive representation. Hj. Noormiliyani was chosen as a research object because she was the only female political leader who came up from the democratic system in South Kalimantan. Not only that, she's also the first regent who initiated e-voting for village head election in the whole of regent in South Kalimantan.

This study is qualitative research using multiple sources of evidence as the basic data analysis. The use of multiple sources of evidence aims to provide researchers with the opportunity to guide the researcher for getting broader historical issues, behavior, and observations (Creswell, 2007). Therefore, the conclusions and findings produced in this research will be more convincing and precise because they are based on several different sources of information, following the form of support. The following is the data search steps in the triangulation data collection method to obtain data validity from multiple sources of evidence, namely literature study, direct observation, in-depth interviews, and archival recordings. There are 5 key informants of this study which is Hj. Noormiliyani as female regent, the head of the village department in Barito Kuala government, and the women who became village heads by e-voting held in Barito Kuala Regency.

## **3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

### **3.1. Literature Review: Women Descriptive Representation and Substantive Representation**

Theoretical and empirical studies of political representation by Hanna Pitkin's seminal work, *The Concept of Representation* (1967) is the most widely referenced scholar of representation and democratic performance (Kurebwa, 2015a). Many contemporary empirical and theoretical studies of politics begin and/or end with Pitkin's seminal taxonomy to map the various roles of elected representatives (Celis et al., 2008; Celis & Childs, 2012; Celis & Mazur, 2012; Dovi, 2007; Valeria Roito & Puspita Zebua, 2020). He argued that while formalistic, descriptive, and symbolic were limited, substantive representation—what he often called 'acting for' representation—was the only true type. Formal representation refers to the formal agreement between the representative and the represented, the process for authorizing the representative, and accountability to the represented. But the problem with this conception is that while representatives are held accountable for what they do, all their actions are considered 'representations', regardless of the quality of their intervention when they occur. Then the symbolic representation mostly lies in the attitudes and beliefs represented. The downside to this conception is that it is not only open to manipulation by representation, but also tends to involve big pictures that are arbitrary and thus have little or no real meaning. Descriptive representation refers to what the representative "looks" like, who they are is what makes them representative, but according to Pitkin, the emphasis is on the composition of political institutions rather than their activities. In contrast to these three aspects, substantive representation must be responsive to what is represented and not vice versa. In most circumstances, this implies that the will of the represented and the actions of the representatives will meet (Pitkin, 1967, 163–65).

Although Pitkin in rejecting too strong a focus on descriptive representation because it distracts from substantive representation, which according to him is a much more important dimension of representation. In the distinction between descriptive and substantive representations, Pitkin emphasizes the importance of having representatives who use their discretion to judge and act, and he makes many important points against writers who focus too much on the composition of legislatures, or who appear to be descriptive "mirror" representation as a guarantor of a better

democracy. Descriptive representation, on its account, selects “representatives who share our values and commitments” (Celis & Mazur, 2012; Uhlaner, 2012; Wängnerud, 2009).

Descriptive representation is important because of what it symbolizes for us in terms of citizenship and inclusion — what it tells us about who is and is not considered a full member of society. This is not symbolism that Pitkin means when he talks about symbolic representation, for he means the symbolic representation of something like a nation or the union of a nation. The point, rather, is that changing patterns of representation are important because of the challenges they (again) present to social and political hierarchies (Celis & Mazur, 2012; Dovi, 2007). We also wish more descriptive pattern of representation that will change policy direction, but even if it does not have such a significant effect, it can still serve an important objective.

Descriptive representation of women has consumed most of the attention of feminist scholars who do so for intrinsic reasons such as democratic values such as fairness, (Asiedu et al., n.d.; Celis & Mazur, 2012). They also thought that it would have a further impact on women's substantive representation. Women's substantive representation would benefit from shifting attention away from the relationship between descriptive and substantive representations towards substantive representations such as: how it was done, who it implied, where it happened, and for what reasons (Celis et al., 2008). This approach is partly consistent with Pitkin's definition of substantive representation as 'acting for the interests of those represented, in a manner that is responsive to them' (Pitkin, 1967). Eulau and Karps (1977) interpret substantive representation to refer to the responsiveness of policy to legislate and implement policies responsive to citizens' demands, whereas Wahlke (1971) has observed that policy responsiveness receives too much emphasis given the evidence that citizens have little coherence. policy beliefs and that representatives are poorly informed about citizens' policy preferences except in exceptional cases. However, Bullock (1995) also Reingold (2000) have attempted a variety of them to measure policy responsiveness both to the public interest as a whole and to race- and gender-

based interests (Pitkin, 1967) and women's interests in various ways to include women's autonomy and well-being (Celis et al., 2008).

Women's substantive representation take as their point of departure in Pitkin's concept of representing as an 'act for' and 'in the interest of' (Pitkin, 1967). The concept of women's substantive representation finds difficulty explained in the book, *The Politics of Presence*, by Phillips (1995) which acknowledges that there is no "empirical or theoretical plausibility" for women to share the ideas or experiences that translate into shared beliefs or goals. The above arguments for women's presence, even when premised on gender rather than sex, means that descriptive representation denotes "shared experiences" (gender) and "not only visible characteristics" (sex) and aims to sidestep the essentialist trap (Kurebwa, 2015). This gives women representatives "communicative and informational advantages" and enables them to "forge bonds of trust" with the women they represent based on their gendered experiences (Mansbridge in (Kurebwa, 2015b).

Phillips (1995), in her book *Politics of Presence*, indicates that descriptive and substantive representation cannot be separated because the presence of women representatives experiences a sense of belonging to, and has strong mutual relationships with, women (Atthahara & Priyanti, 2018). They share aims with women that is they would want to see women's "improved social, economic and political status" also experience a "reciprocated sense of having their fate linked with women" (Dovi, 2007: 736). There are two distinct modes of politics: a "politics of ideas" and a "politics of presence, then Phillips ultimately endorses a mix of her two modes of politics, noting that "it is in the relationship between ideas and presence that we can best hope to find a fairer system of representation, not in a false opposition between one and the other" (1995:25, in Pitkin, 1967)) . She emphasizes that ideas (interests) cannot be completely separated from people who share those interests. Burrell (1996: 151) notes: "Women in public office stand as symbols for other women, both enhancing their identification with the system and their ability to influence within it (Kurebwa, 2015). So, if women in politics serve as symbols and provide cues about the political system's legitimacy, there

should be quantifiable differences between women represented by women and women represented by men.

### **3.2. Female Regent Presence for Rural Women Descriptive Representative**

Normiliyani is the first and only female regent in South Kalimantan to be elected in the 2017 PILKADA as partner Rahmadian Noor (Hasan, 2016; Naimi, 2021; Tabri, 2021). This woman who was born in Banjarmasin, on April 21, 1959, is the daughter of the late H Aberani Sulaiman, Governor of South Kalimantan from 1963-1968. In 1970 Normiliyani completed her basic education at SDN Rajawali Banjarmasin, then she also completed his high school education at SMPN Taruna Jakarta in 1973 also continued her studies at SMA 24 Jakarta and succeeded in obtaining a Bachelor of Law (SH) degree at Lambung Mangkurat University in 1986 (Naimi, 2021; Tabri, 2021) . She is also active as a member of the Student Executive Board (BEM) of the Faculty of Law, at Lambung Mangkurat University. She is a member of various youth organizations (OKP) such as Panca Marga Youth (PPM), Indonesian Young Generation Youth (AMPI), Communication Forum for Retired Women and Children of the Indonesian National Police (FKPPI), and the Indonesian National Youth Committee (KNPI) (Jamaluddin et al., 2018). According to an interview with Hj. Noormiliyani, Education at Lambung Mangkurat University in the faculty of law, especially the concentration in governance law was useful and helped to make her understand and be more critical about political science and political practice (Noormiliyani AS, interview, 15 february 2023).

Hj. Normiliyani is the wife of Hasanuddin Murad who was the former Regent of Barito Kuala for two terms, then she started her first political career in Barito Kuala as head of the Family Empowerment Center (PKK) of Barito Kuala Regency. Her status as the regent's wife makes her responsible for the district women's organization which coordinates village community organizations. She made such a big impact as a leader that made PKK a mini-government that collaborated with several SKPDs for collaborative programs such as Gebyar PAUD for toddler health, and Gebyar Posyandu

to invite community specialist doctors in Barito Kuala, which have also been carried out. 140 houses were restored (Jamaluddin et al., 2018).

After leading the PKK in Barito Kuala, Normiliyani was elected with the most votes in legislative elections and became the first woman to chair the DPRD in South Kalimantan Province for the 2014-2019 period. However, in 2016, he started running as a candidate for regent of Barito Kuala in the general election for Regent of Barito Kuala in 2017. "Even though the political parties, especially GOLKAR, did not nominate me in the Pilkada Batola which is scheduled for February 2017, I will still run as 'number one' in the district government (Pemkab) through individual channels or independent channels," she warned (Noormiliyani AS, interview, 15 february 2023). As a "Srikandi" from the Golkar Party, she finally held elections and became the first female regent as well as a female leader in Barito Kuala's local politics (Hasan, 2016).

In practice, descriptive representation attempts to remedy unjust social conditions by providing opportunities for historically marginalized groups such as women to become political elites. Thus, proponents assert that descriptive representation protects the interests of the disadvantaged (Kurebwa, 2015). The presence of Hj Noormiliyani, who succeeded in becoming a regional head and also as a descriptive representative of women at the village level, certainly had a positive impact on several leadership structures in Barito Kuala. Many were inspired and used as inspiration in making up their minds to become leaders and voices, especially for women's aspirations.

### **3.3 Female Regent Existence As A Mediator Between Descriptive And Substantive Representations**

The female regent role in this part has shown that Hj. Noormiliyani was an individual who could establish the existence of a connection between descriptive and substantive representation. The presence has been seen as a woman's descriptive representation toward the achievement of the substantive representation by fulfilling her job as a decision-maker and a leader. As a decision maker, she is the one who proposes the new regulation to change the village head election mechanism

electronically and digitally by Raperda number 1 of 2015. As a leader, she had to lead the Barito Kuala stakeholders to pay attention to the preparation of electronic elections for the head village. She had to ensure that all of the members who joined the visit and workshop could understand how to operate the devices, to fulfill her obligation to uphold democracy not only for men but also for all people by electronic voting for village head elections.

Hj. Noormiliyani AS submitted the Raperda (regional regulation program) on November 24, 2020, through a Plenary meeting of Batola DPRD that was chaired by Deputy Chairmen M Agung Purnomo and Hj Arfah. Batola DPRD has approved the Second Amendment to the Raperda Number 1 of 2015 which is concerning to Procedures for Nomination, Election, Appointment, Inauguration and Dismissal of Village Heads, Wednesday (03/03/2021) (IKP, 2021; Rudy, 2021). Simultaneous Village Head Elections (Pilkades) through the E-Voting System (elections through an electronic system) in Barito Kuala (Batola) Regency which are planned for April 2021 was a responsive manifestation of the digitalization age to show that technology can be applied in various fields including the needs of democracy.

Since 2013, the village elections in Indonesia have introduced a new way of voting, namely through electronic devices or e-voting. This mechanism was initiated by the Agency for the Study and Application of Technology (BPPT) in collaboration with the Ministry of Communication and Information and the local Government. The new way of voting for village elections will cause some shocks to the community while using sophisticated electronic devices. The tools are beyond of village communities' knowledge, so to reduce the risks in the e-voting implementation, the female regent has to do the working visit as well as technical outreach on the implementation of e-voting, which was also attended by the Head of the Batola Community and Village Empowerment Service (DPMD), Dahlan, and the Chair of Commission I, Basuki, was received by the Sleman Regional Secretary Hardo Kiswoyo and the Managing Director of PT Intens Rizky Ayunda Pratama (as equipment vendor) at East Parc Hotel Sleman, Jogjakarta, Tuesday (27/10/2020). The Barito Kuala government should go to Yogyakarta, not only for a visit but also to learn and train about electronic machines

that will be used first in Sleman Regency. Hj. Noormiliyani takes the opportunity and big chance for has been to participate and make a partnership with the Sleman government regency to learn together. Then before the implementation of the simultaneous village head elections using electronic voting technology (E-Voting), the Regent of Barito Kuala (Batola) Hj Noormiliyani AS together with the Deputy Regent (Wabup) H Rahmadian Noor, and other Stakeholders visited Sleman Regency, Jogjakarta. Head of the PMD Batola Department, Dahlan, said that Sleman Regency was chosen for the visit because the district was the first to implement e-voting.

Even though Sleman Regency was the first, but Batola Regency would implement wider and more massive to apply the e-voting in the half of Barito Kuala Regency. Sleman Regional Secretary, Hardo Kiswoyo, who welcomed the comparative study held by the Batola Regency Government and its staff and village heads had expressed his admiration for the Batola Regency Government which will hold simultaneous village elections in 195 villages. Bring some of the village heads from Barito Kuala, the female regent has ordered them to explore the information and pay close attention to the presentation and explanations that have been given.

The workshop was done in interactive dialogue and a presentation from Rizky Ayunda Pratama as Main Director of PT Intens that based in Bandung City. Rizky Ayunda Pratama in his presentation explained that the e-voting tool consists of a KTP or fingerprint reader, a laptop for verification, a second laptop to produce ballot papers, a touch screen PC for selecting candidates, a smart card, and a hot printer. Next, he explained the stages of selecting using an e-voting tool; first, the prospective voter's ID card is scanned and then matched with the prospective voter's fingerprint. If verified, it will produce a token code which is input into the smart card which is then used to access the touchscreen computer used in voting. After the voter makes their choice, a paper showing evidence of their choice will be printed which will be stored in the ballot box as evidence at trial if a contest is possible. And they have a guarantee that the system is safe because it is encrypted and not connected to any network.

### **3.4 Women Substantive Representation on New Village Election Policy Implementation**

The representation is said to engage in decision-making and local policy formulation promoted by the elected councilors. Although, in the broader view of a political principle, Heywood (2002: 224) said that representation is a relationship through which an individual or group stands for or acts on behalf of a larger group of people (Rahmanto et al., 2021). We believe that 'women' are not a homogeneous but a heterogeneous group – and we also contend that good representation is enhanced by 'the making present of' complementary, competing, and conflicting views on what women, and their interests and needs, are. Then this female regent decision to strengthen the village democratization by e-voting for village head elections had in line with the description of Pitkin's contention that responsiveness is a necessary criterion of substantive representation (Celis et al., 2008; Celis & Mazur, 2012). Accordingly, gender and politics scholars should both admit to the presence of conservative representatives in our parliaments (and elsewhere, for that matter) and investigate their role in the substantive representation of women.

The e-voting system has various advantages for strengthening democracy implementation at the village level, doing voting by simply touching the image mark on the vote counting panel will be faster and more accurate, so no votes are lost, and the security system is guaranteed by the electronic audit of a voter's choice, and guaranteeing transparency, accountability, speed for the public to access election results, and dismiss commit fraud in vote counting. Hj. Noormiliyani had actively socialized e-voting to people in rural areas, "Because e-voting is new, yes, we will try to socialize it even more optimally. Because it is very unfortunate if their voting rights are not exercised," she said (IKP, 2021, 2021).

Deputy Regent H Rahmadian Noor said the use of the E-Voting method in elections is constitutional following the decision of the Constitutional Court (MK) Number 147/PUU-VII/2009, but it is required that it does not violate the principles of direct, public, free, secret, honest and fair, and the regions that will apply it are ready in terms of technology, financing, human resources, software, community readiness in

the area concerned, as well as other requirements (IKP, 2021c; Rudy, 2021; Sari et al., 2021). Based on the Constitutional Court's decision also supported by the DPRD's approval, the Batola Regency Government through this Raperda could hold the Simultaneous in April by e-voting system for the first time in South Kalimantan.

The implementation of E-voting Village Head Elections (Pilkades) in Barito Kuala Regency (Batola) for the 2021-2027 period had been completed in 4 batches with 3-day voting intervals which were started on 7 February 2021 and completed in May 2021. Hj. Noormiliyani as a female regent has directly done the monitoring to the polling station that held e-voting especially in the first batch. She's actively taken the sample to know how the election process. This policy is one of the biggest decisions that she made, that's why she gives big concern for the E-voting implementation. She must struggle to convincing the minister of home affair, the governor, the bureaucracy, the village head, also the people in Barito Kuala. Even though in the beginning she had rejected by minister, then she wasn't giving up. She takes the risk to against the ministry and those who oppose it. Because this program is important for Barito Kuala to prove that they are not a regency who left behind, but as a pioneer for digital democracy in village level.

The monitoring has divided into several area where the female regent and the Deputy Regent H Rahmadian should be separated to get broader sample from polling stations. And they both got help by members of DPRD of Barito Kuala, the head of resort police, the Regional Leadership Coordination Forum (FORKOPIMDA), the head of regional apparatus (SKPD) in Barito Kuala, and the head of a sub-district in Barito Kuala area. Hj. Noormiliyani had said "I'm very grateful for the results of the monitoring that we carried out in the first period, the implementation went smoothly, even though it was still something new for the community, but it could be several points of note for future improvements". The collaboration monitoring among stake holders of Barito Kuala Regency had actively done till the last batch and during the monitoring of e-voting village head elections, Hj. Noormiliyani AS has seen how the voters' enthusiasm were significantly increased. From the early batch of electronic voting, the participation

was around 60 to 70 percent, then in the later of e-voting election implementation the voter had increased to 90 percent (IKP, 2021, 2021).

The election that was held in 163 villages in 17 sub-districts found 11 people (6.7 percent) who won by female candidates. Those 11 candidates are Hj Norliani from Tabunganen Muara Village, Purnamawati from Tamban Raya Village, Mardina from Sepakat Bersama Village, Noorjanah from Patih Muhur Lama Village, Cahyo Utami Ningsih from Karang Dukuh Village, Elly Rahmah from Belandean Village, Syarifah Syaufiah SPd from Pulau Sewangi Village, Hj Siti Khadijah SAP MM from Sungai Raya Village, Hamidah SPd from Karya Makmur Village and Hj Yuliana SE from Taurkan Raya Village, and Rasidah from Balukung Village (IKP, 2021a).

This number does not include 1 village head from Batik Village, Bakumpai District, whose term of office has not yet ended. So that the representation of women in village heads will reach 12 people or 7.4 percent. Hj Noormiliyani, who is the first female regent in South Kalimantan, said it was time for women to be given the trust and opportunity to lead and explore their abilities, behavior, traits, and culture to slowly integrate. "I feel applauded and proud of the achievements that even their vote acquisition is very significant. Even though all of this did not come from party cadres or political figures but came from various components of society," concluded the former chairman of the DPR. DPRD of South Kalimantan Province.

#### **4. CONCLUSIONS**

In this article, we attempt to make a case for shifting the terms of the women's representative debate. The point we wish on women's representation is that those studying women's leadership as representatives must examine how descriptive representation leads to substantive representation in the case of female regent policy for conservative issues. Descriptive representation might increase the responsiveness of substantive representation by the government. this study has further investigated how descriptive representation leads to substantive representation in the case of Barito Kuala female regent as descriptive representative had an impact on the substantive representative by conservative policy to implement e-voting for head village elections.

The presence of a woman as a leader had meaning as an active subject that responded to the political problems in Barito Kuala then the presence as a regent obligated her to be involved with government activities such as implementing the policy. whether substantive or descriptive representation is necessary to create symbolic representations and perceptions that government outcomes are fair and legitimate (Hayes & Hibbing, 2017). Marschall and Shah (2007) said that the way of the representatives reflect the descriptive representatives by promote their voters' interests while in power engage in substantive representation (Rosenthal, 2019). And by implementing the e-voting head village elections in Barito Kuala, Hj. Noormiliyani's presence and response have encouraged rural women to be involved in fair and just political competition that guarantees by technology or e-voting itself. This research has shown that female regents have integrated their presence and their actions to bring benefits to other women by policy implementation which means descriptive representations were integrated with the substantive representatives even in conservative women's substantive representation.

## REFERENCES

- Asiedu, E., Branstette, C., & Malokele, N. (n.d.). *The Effect of Women's Representation in Parliament and the Passing of Gender Sensitive Policies*.
- Aspinall, E., White, S., & Savirani, A. (2021). Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs Women's Political Representation in Indonesia: Who Wins and How? In *Journal of Current Southeast Asian Affairs* (Vol. 40, Issue 1).
- Atthahara, H., & Priyanti, E. (2018). PEREMPUAN KEPALA DAERAH: ANALISIS KINERJA BUPATI CELLICA NURRACHADIANA DALAM PROGRAM KEPENTINGAN PRAKTIS GENDER DI KABUPATEN KARAWANG. *Jurnal Politikom Indonesiana, Vol 4*(No. 2), 72–86.
- Celis, K., & Childs, S. (2012). The Substantive Representation of Women: What to Do with Conservative Claims? *Political Studies, 60*(1), 213–225. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9248.2011.00904.x>

- Celis, K., Childs, S., Kantola, J., & Krook, M. L. (2008). Rethinking women's substantive representation. *Representation*, 44(2), 99–110. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00344890802079573>
- Celis, K., & Mazur, A. G. (2012). Hanna Pitkin's "Concept of Representation" Revisited Introduction. *Politics and Gender*, 8(4), 508–512. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X12000517>
- Dewi, K. H. (2012a). FEMALE LEADERSHIP AND DEMOCRATIZATION IN LOCAL POLITICS SINCE 2005: TREND, PROSPECT, AND REFLECTION IN INDONESIA. *Masyarakat Indonesia*, 38(2), 329.
- Dewi, K. H. (2012b). FEMALE LEADERSHIP AND DEMOCRATIZATION IN LOCAL POLITICS SINCE 2005: TREND, PROSPECT, AND REFLECTION IN INDONESIA. In *Masyarakat Indonesia* (Vol. 38, Issue 2).
- Dovi, S. (2007). Theorizing Women's Representation in the United States. *Politics and Gender*, 3(3), 297–319. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X07000281>
- Galligan, Y. (2007). Gender and Political Representation: Current Empirical Perspectives. *International Political Science Review*, 28(5), 557–570. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0192512107082100>
- Hasan, S. (2016). *Noormiliyani Tetap Mencalon Bupati Barito Kuala Kalsel*. AntaraKalsel.Com. <https://kalsel.antaranews.com/berita/37010/noormiliyani-tetap-mencalon-bupati-barito-kuala-kalsel>
- Hayes, M., & Hibbing, M. V. (2017). The Symbolic Benefits of Descriptive and Substantive Representation. *Political Behavior*, 39(1), 31–50. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11109-016-9345-9>
- Hillman, B. (2017). Increasing Women's Parliamentary Representation in Asia and the Pacific: The Indonesian Experience. *Asia and the Pacific Policy Studies*, 4(1), 38–49. <https://doi.org/10.1002/app5.160>
- Hillman, B. (2018). The Limits of Gender Quotas: Women's Parliamentary Representation in Indonesia, *Journal of Contemporary Asia*. *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, 48(2), 322–338.
- IKP. (2021a). *Keterwakilan Perempuan Raih 6,7 Persen di Pilkades*. Baritokualakab.Go.Id. <https://baritokualakab.go.id/2021/06/03/keterwakilan-perempuan-raih-67-persen-di-pilkades/>
- IKP. (2021b). *Noormiliyani Bangga, Pemilihan Pilkades Meningkatkan*. Baritokualakab.Go.Id. <https://baritokualakab.go.id/2021/05/29/noormiliyani-bangga-pemilih-pilkades-meningkat/>

- IKP. (2021c). *Pilkades Sistem E-Voting Tinggal Implementasi*. Baritokualakab.Go.Id. <https://baritokualakab.go.id/2021/03/03/pilkades-sistem-e-voting-tinggal-implementasi/>
- IKP. (2021d). *Warga Antusias Sambut Pilkades E-Voting*. Baritokualakab.Go.Id. <https://baritokualakab.go.id/2021/05/25/warga-antusias-sambut-pilkades-e-voting/>
- Jamaluddin, Rahman, G., Pathurrahman, & Mauliana Hairini, S. (2018). The Political Habituation of Women's Leadership in Local Election of Barito Kuala. *International Conference and Workshop on Gender*, 437–450.
- Kania Ikeu, Alamanda Dini Turipanam, & Khilda Fauzi. (2020). The Obstacles of Women's Parliamentary Representation in Indonesia. *Atlantis Press*, 456(Advances in social science, education, and humanities research). <https://www.pikiran-rakyat.com/bandung-raya/pr->
- Krook, M. L. (2010). Beyond supply and demand: A feminist-institutionalist theory of candidate selection. *Political Research Quarterly*, 63(4), 707–720. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1065912909336275>
- Kurebwa, J. (2015a). A Review of Hanna Pitkin's (1967) Conception of Women's Political Representation. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 5(11), 50. [www.ijsrp.org](http://www.ijsrp.org)
- Kurebwa, J. (2015b). A Review of Hanna Pitkin's (1967) Conception of Women's Political Representation. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 5(11), 50. [www.ijsrp.org](http://www.ijsrp.org)
- Lovenduski, J. (2005). *State Feminism and Political Representation*. Cambridge University Press.
- Lovenduski, P. N. and J. (1993). "If Only More Candidates Came Forward": Supply-Side Explanations of Candidate Selection in Britain. *British Journal of Political Science*, 23(3), 373–408.
- Naimi, R. (2021). *Profil Bupati Baritokuala Hj Noormiliyani, Bupati Perempuan Pertama di Kalimantan Selatan*. Banjarmasinpostwiki.Com. <https://banjarmasinpostwiki.tribunnews.com/2021/09/07/profil-bupati-baritokuala-hj-noormiliyani-bupati-perempuan-pertama-di-kalimantan-selatan>
- Perdana, A., & Hillman, B. (2020). Quotas and ballots: The impact of positive action policies on women's representation in Indonesia. *Asia and the Pacific Policy Studies*, 7(2), 158–170. <https://doi.org/10.1002/app5.299>
- Pitkin, H. F. (1967). *The Concept of Representation*. University of California Press.

- Prihatini, E. S. (2018). *Measuring women's chances of winning in indonesia's regional elections*. Theconversation.Com. <https://theconversation.com/measuring-womens-chances-of-winning-in-indonesias-regional-elections-95294>
- Purwanti, A., Wijaningsih, D., & Setiawan, F. A. (2019). The Impact of Indonesian Law No. 6/2014 on Women's Political Participation in the Politics of Kelurahan: A Study on Kelurahan's Community Empowerment Institution (LPMK) in Salatiga, Indonesia. *Jurnal Dinamika Hukum*, 19(2), 283. <https://doi.org/10.20884/1.jdh.2019.19.2.2546>
- Rahmanto, F., Purnomo, E. P., Kasiwi, A. N., & Salsabila, L. (2021). Women's Representation through Political Parties in Parliament Period of General Election 2019-2024. *Politik Indonesia: Indonesian Political Science Review*, 6(3), 336–359. <https://doi.org/10.15294/ipsr.v6i1.22666>
- Rosenthal, M. (2019). When does descriptive representation become substantive? Systematic luck, social power and the allocation of resources. *Ethnicities*, 19(6), 1015–1037. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468796819833062>
- Rudy. (2021). *Mantap! Batola Gelar Pilkades Serentak Secara E-Voting*. BaritoPost.Co.Id. <https://www.baritopost.co.id/mantap-batola-gelar-pilkades-serentak-secara-e-voting/>
- Runciman, D. (2010). Hobbes's theory of representation: Anti-democratic or proto-democratic? In *Political Representation* (pp. 15–34). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511813146.003>
- Sari, N., Hairini, S. M., & Amin, M. F. M. (2021). Informal Political Communication Of Women In Local Democracy: Study at BPD Baliuk Village. *Barito Kuala. MetaCommunication: Journal of Communication Studies*, 6(2), 122–130.
- Shim, J. (2021). *Gender and Politics in Northeast Asia: Legislative Patterns and Substantive Representation in Korea and Taiwan*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1554477X.2021.1888677>
- Tabri, M. (2021). *Kalslopedia: Profile Bupati Barito Kuala Hj Noormiliyani, Bupati Perempuan Pertama di Kalsel*. TribunBatola.Com. <https://banjarmasin.tribunnews.com/2021/09/07/kalslopedia-profile-bupati-barito-kuala-hj-noormiliyani-bupati-perempuan-pertama-di-kalsel>
- Uhlener, C. J. (2012). Potentiality and representation: The link between descriptive representation and participation in the united states. In *Politics and Gender* (Vol. 8, Issue 4, pp. 535–541). <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1743923X12000566>
- Valeria Roito, F., & Puspita Zebua, L. (2020). Peran Perempuan Anggota Badan Permusyawaratan Desa dalam Memperjuangkan Aspirasi Perempuan Tahun 2020

(Studi Perbandingan Desa Sindanglaya-Lebak dan Desa Hiliweto-Nias). *Jurnal Inada*, 03(2).

Wängnerud, L. (2009). Women in parliaments: Descriptive and substantive representation. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 12, 51–69. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.polisci.11.053106.123839>

Weaver, K. (n.d.). *Feminism Under Duress: Was the Thatcher Government Bad for the Women's Movement in the U.K.?*